BEFORE THE ARIZONA BOARD OF OSTEOPATHIC EXAMINERS IN MEDICINE AND SURGERY IN THE MATTER OF Case No. DO-14-0301A JOHN DUMBOLTON, D.O. CONSENT AGREEMENT, FINDINGS Holder of License No. 3568 OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW 6 AND ORDER FOR PRACTICE For the Practice of osteopathic medicine RESTRICTION in the State of Arizona, 7 Respondent. 8 CONSENT AGREEMENT 10 By mutual agreement and understanding between the Arizona Board of Osteopathic 11 Examiners in Medicine and Surgery ("Board") and John Dumbolton, D.O. ("Respondent"), the 12 13 parties agree to the following disposition of this matter. 1. Respondent has read and understands this Consent Agreement, stipulated Findings 14 15 of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Order ("Consent Agreement"). Respondent acknowledges that 16 he understands he has the right to consult with legal counsel regarding this matter and has done 17 so or chooses not to do so. 18 2. By entering into this Consent Agreement, Respondent voluntarily relinquishes any 19 rights to a hearing or judicial review in state or federal court on the matters alleged, or to 20 challenge this Consent Agreement in its entirety as issued by the Board, and waives any other 21 cause of action related thereto or arising from this Consent Agreement. 22. 3. This Consent Agreement shall become effective when approved by the Board and 23 24 signed by the Executive Director. 25 4. Respondent admits to the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law contained in this

1

2

3

4

5

9

26

Consent Agreement

- 5. This Consent Agreement, or any part thereof, may be considered in any future disciplinary action against Respondent.
- 6. This Consent Agreement does not constitute a dismissal or resolution of other matters currently pending before the Board, if any, and does not constitute any waiver, express or implied, of the Board's statutory authority or jurisdiction. The acceptance of this Consent Agreement does not preclude any other agency, subdivision or officer of the State from instituting other civil or criminal proceedings with respect to the conduct that is the subject of this Consent Agreement.
- 7. All admissions made by Respondent are solely for the final disposition of this matter and any subsequent administrative proceedings or litigation involving the Board, Respondent and the State of Arizona; and, therefore, said admissions by Respondent are not intended for any other purpose or administrative regulatory proceeding or litigation in another state or federal court.
- 8. Upon signing this agreement and returning this document (or a copy thereof) to the Board's Executive Director, Respondent may not revoke the acceptance of the Consent Agreement. Respondent may not make any modifications to the document. Any modifications to the original document are ineffective and void unless mutually approved by the parties.
- 9. If the Board does not adopt this Consent Agreement, Respondent will not assert as a defense that the Board's consideration of this Consent Agreement constitutes bias, prejudice, prejudgment or other similar defense.

10. This Consent Agreement, once approved and signed, is a public record that will be publicly disseminated as a formal action of the Board and will be reported to the National Practitioner Databank and on the Board's website.

11. If any part of this Consent Agreement is later declared void or otherwise unenforceable, the remainder of the Consent Agreement in its entirety shall remain in force and effect

John Dumbolton, D.O.

Dated: Z-Z\$-17

### FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Board is the duly constituted authority for the regulation and control of the practice of osteopathic medicine in the State of Arizona. Respondent is the holder of License No. 3568 for the practice of osteopathic medicine in the state of Arizona.
- 2. In November 2014, the Arizona Board of Osteopathic Examiners in Medicine and Surgery received notice of an action taken by the North Dakota Medical Board ("NDMB") against Respondent as a result of his emergency treatment of a patient who presented after several days of alcohol consumption. The NDMB alleged that Respondent's care of the patient was substandard and grossly negligent, in that Respondent failed to properly monitor the patient and failed to recognize the need to transfer the patient to an institution adequately equipped to provide the appropriate level of care. The patient expired while in Respondent's care.
- 3. On September 14, 2014, Respondent entered into a voluntary stipulation with the NDMB which placed his North Dakota license on a three year stayed suspension and required

him to complete a competence assessment course at the Center for Personalized Education for Physicians ("CPEP") and to comply with any and all recommendations made by CPEP.

- 4. Respondent completed the CPEP assessment in December 2015. The CPEP assessment report found Respondent demonstrated overall poor knowledge of the emergency medicine topics discussed, with pronounced deficiencies in areas of high mortality and morbidity, including cardiology and infectious disease. Based on a review of Respondent's patient charts, his clinical judgment and reasoning were found to be inadequate with overall poor patient care and his documentation was also found to be inadequate. CPEP recommended that Respondent undergo retraining in a residency or residency-like" setting and did not believe he demonstrated the ability to remain in independent practice while attempting to remediate his clinical skills.
- 5. Based on the results of the CPEP assessment, Respondent and the NDMB entered into a stipulated order on April 20, 2016 which suspended Respondent's North Dakota license until such time as he successfully completes retraining in a residency or residency-like setting.

## **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- 1. The Board possesses jurisdiction over the subject matter hereof and over Respondent.
- 2. The conduct described in the above Findings of Fact constitutes unprofessional conduct as defined in A.R.S. §32-1854 (18) and (38) and is grounds for disciplinary action pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-1855.

### **ORDER**

# IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:

- 1. Respondent's license to practice osteopathic medicine, No. 3568, is

  RESTRICTED. Respondent shall not practice medicine of any kind, including any medicine involving direct or indirect patient care, except that Respondent may continue to provide disability and pension evaluations and physicals but is prohibited from prescribing any form of treatment or medications, until Respondent applies to the Board and receives permission to do so as set forth below. The restriction of Respondent's license is effective upon signature of this Order by the Board's Executive Director.
- 2. The restriction of Respondent's license shall continue until such time as the Board determines, in its sole discretion, that Respondent may safely resume the practice of medicine. Upon a finding that Respondent may safely resume practice in the State of Arizona, the Board may terminate or modify the license restriction and/or place other practice restrictions on Respondent, as deemed necessary after notice and an opportunity for hearing.
- 3. Failure to abide by this Consent Agreement and Order constitutes unprofessional conduct and may result in the suspension or revocation of Respondent's license.

DATED AND EFFECTIVE this 2nd day of Work, 2017.

THE STATE OF THE S

ARIZONA BOARD OF OSTEOPATHIC EXAMINERS IN MEDICINE AND SURGERY

Jenna Jones

Executive Director

1	
2	Original of the foregoing filed this 2 <sup>nd</sup> day of <u>Hack</u> , 2017, with:
3	Arizona Board of Osteopathic Examiners 9535 E. Doubletree Ranch Road Scottsdale, AZ 85258-5539
4	
5	Scottsdale, AZ 83238-3339
6	Copy of the foregoing mailed U.S.
7	Certified Mail this Z <sup>M</sup> day of March 2017 to:
8	Brendan Murphy, Esq. Hendricks Murphy
9	3101 N. Central Avenue, Ste. 970
10	Phoenix, AZ 85012
11	Copy of the foregoing mailed U.S.
12	regular mail this Zhay of March 2017 to:
13	Jeanne Galvin
14	Asst. Attorney General Arizona Attorney General's Office
15	1275 W. Washington Phoenix, Arizona 85007
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
	1